Islamic Republic of Afghanistan

Ministry of Finance

Capacity Building for Results Program (CBR)

Frequently Asked Questions (FAQs)

I. What is CBR?

Question 1:   What is the Capacity Building for Results (CBR) Program?

The Capacity Building for Results Program (CBR) is an institutional development and public administration reform program launched in 2012 by the Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan (GIRoA).

Question 2:   What is CBR's Development Objective (DO)?

CBR's development objective (DO) is to improve the capacity and performance of priority line ministries and independent agencies in selected reform areas. This is intended to be achieved by supporting the restructuring of select line ministries and independent agencies, and helping them plan and budget by facilitating the required skills as identified in their respective CBR reform proposal. "Selected reform areas" refers to business process, training or service target improvements that would vary for each line ministry and independent agency depending on its respective CBR reform proposal and results framework.

Question 3:   What other objectives does CBR support?

CBR contributes to: (a) Service delivery improvement; (b) Simplifying business processes; (c) Increasing budget execution in the public sector; (d) Attention to sub- national administration development performance; (d) ensuring a harmonized, consistent, and fair pay framework; and (e) reducing the reliance on parallel structures and focusing on core functions and career development of the civil service.

Question 4:   Is CBR a national program and who funds it?

CBR is a national program led by Afghans and funded by the Afghanistan Reconstruction Trust Fund (ARTF) through the National Development Budget. CBR is currently budgeted for US$150 million over an initial 5 year period.

Question 5:   How will government maintain CBR as donor funding gradually reduces?

CBR is a 5-year program which in itself is longer than most donor funded programs. Public administration reform is a long-term process especially in difficult contexts such as Afghanistan. It is expected that with successful implementation of the current phase of CBR that the Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan (GIRoA) will be in a strong position to request extension and additional financing of CBR or a follow-on program through the ARTF. Reforming Afghanistan's public administration will contribute to improving service delivery and therefore to sustainable revenue generation. This is expected to help the government to continue CBR which is to cost the equivalent of 0.25% of the Afghanistan GDP in 2016-17 from its own budget in the long run.

Question 6:   What are CBR's major benefits for Afghanistan?

As part of the CBR program, line ministries and independent agencies are required to develop and implement major reforms to their structures, develop the capacity of civil servants,

improve budget execution, simplify business processes, increase revenue collection and enhance their ability to design and implement development programs independently. All of the above mentioned improvements are expected to be manifested in improved public service delivery to the Afghan citizens.

Question 7: How is CBR different from other public administration reform efforts?

Unlike previous public administration reform programs that functioned as parallel entities within the government and focused on narrow areas, CBR supports broad reforms in public administration at both the national and sub-national level. These include restructuring of line ministries and independent agencies, and recruiting and building capacity of civil servants to contribute towards helping government achieving its targeted results. CBR interventions are specifically tailored and driven by the respective line ministries and independent agencies ensuring ownership. CBR also serves to consolidate key donors interventions towards public administration reform into one program under the umbrella of the ARTF.

II. How is CBR managed?

Question 8:   How is CBR overseen, managed and implemented?

The CBR program is overseen by a Steering Committee (SC) chaired by the Minister of Finance and composed of the Chairman of the Independent Administrative Reform and Civil Service Commission (IARCSC), Deputy Chief of Staff of the Administrative Office of the President (AOP) and a Ministerial Advisory Committee (MAC). The MAC comprises ministers from priority CBR line ministries, which include: Ministry of Agriculture Irrigation and Livestock (MAIL), Ministry of Commerce and Industries (MoCI), Ministry of Petroleum and Mines (MoPM), Ministry of Public Health (MoPH), Ministry of Communications and Information Technology (MoCIT) and Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs, Martyrs and Disabled (MoLSAMD). The members of the MAC will be co-opted into the SC whenever necessary.

The program is managed and facilitated jointly by the Ministry of Finance (MoF), and Independent Administrative Reform and Civil Service Commission (IARCSC). Participating line ministries and independent agencies are responsible for designing and implementing their CBR reform proposals. Project Support Units (PSUs) in MoF and IARCSC assist participating line ministries and independent agencies with drafting CBR reform proposals, recruitment and reforming public administration structures but overall responsibility for implementation resides in the respective line ministry and independent agency.

The below flow chart captures the relevant stakeholders and their respective functions and responsibilities within CBR.

STEERING COMMITTEE
Reporting to President and Cabinet on regular basis
(**Comprised**: Finance Minister as Chair, IARCSC Chairman, AOP representative and Minister's Advisory Group
Functions:
1. Oversight and strategic guidance on Project implementation, including selection of participating Entities (approval of CBRPs and number of CBR civil servant posts, etc.)
2. Approve technical assistance (types/allocations) for selected Entities
3. Approve composition of Independent Expert Groups to screen CBRPs.

MOF-CBR-PSU
Functions:
1. Regular convening of the Project Steering Committee (SC) to which it reports and acts as secretariat.
2. Overall project management and administration
3. Carrying out of procurement and financial management
4. Provision of TA to LMs for preparation and implementation of CBRPs
5. Recruitment of (non-CBRP) TA for LMs
6. Monitoring and reporting on LM implementation of CBRPs with support of M&E firm (*jointly with IARCSC PSU)*
7. Evaluating effectiveness and efficiency of CBR activities

IARCSC-CBR-PSU
Functions:
1. Oversee recruitment of CBR appointees, including:
1.1 Prepare recruitment procedure
1.2 Review and approve job descriptions
1.3 Observe and monitor recruitment processes at LMs with support of HR firm
1.4. Sign contracts and oversee contract management
1.5 Monitor LM performance evaluations
3. Oversee and manage all aspects related to training
4. Monitoring and reporting on LM implementation of CBRPs (*jointly with MoF PSU)*

WB TASK TEAM
Functions:
1. Review of consultant ToRs
2. Review of consultant selections above $50,000 (to be increased to $100,000) and for PSU, FM, PR and Legal services.
3. Ex-post review of CBR appointments/procurement

LINE MINISTRIES
Functions:
1. Development of CBRPs including requesting no. and type of CBR and TA posts
2. Implementation of CBRPs
3. Recruitment of CBR appointees, including: job descriptions, advertisement, long and shortlisting, written test, and final selection
4. Performance management of CBR appointees

III.   How does CBR work?

Question 9:   What are the main components of CBR?

CBR has three inter-related components: (a) Technical Assistance Facility in Support of Civil Service Reform; (b) Building Human Resources; and (c) Project Management, Monitoring and Evaluation.

Question 10: What kind of support is provided by CBR?

CBR provides an inclusive package of support to line ministries/agencies. This involves limited technical assistance (short term consultants) to support the development and implementation of CBR reform proposals; recruitment of senior and mid-level civil service managers, professional staff; and assistance in monitoring CBR reform proposal implementation.

Question 11: Who can apply for CBR support?

All line ministries and independent agencies are eligible to apply and receive support. However, CBR applies a focused approach through which the extent of support provided to a ministry or independent agency is determined based on that ministry or agencies' categorization (Category I or II). Category I ministries and independent agencies are eligible to receive full-fledged CBR support. This category priorities interested line ministries and independent agencies (Table 1 below) with: (i) service delivery responsibility; (ii) revenue-generation potential; (iii) employment-generation potential; (iv) a high development budget share; and/or (v) a high ratio of externally-funded staff. The project's implementing entities – MoF, IARCSC, and AOP – are also eligible to receive full-fledged CBR support. All other ministries/agencies are considered as Category II and are eligible to receive common function support. These ministries/agencies are also eligible for and encouraged to access "CBR-readiness support". This includes limited civil servant recruitments and technical assistance designed to help graduate these ministries/agencies to Category I status.

Table 1: List of "Priority" line ministries and independent agencies

#	Ministry/Agency	Criteria					Status
		Service delivery	Revenue Generation	Employment generation	Dev. budget share	High external staff share	
1	Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation and Livestock (MAIL)	X	X	X	X	X	CBRP developed and approved by SC, including an initial 331posts.

2	Ministry of Communication and Information Technology (MOCIT)	X	X	X			CBRP developed and approved by SC, including an initial 300 posts.
3	Ministry of Public Health (MoPH)	X			X	X	CBRP developed and approved by SC, including an initial 510 posts.
4	Ministry of Petroleum and Mines (MoMP)		X	X		X	CBRP developed and approved by SC, including 153 total posts (initial 103 posts).
5	Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MoLSAD)	X		X			CBRP developed and approved by SC, including an initial 85 posts.
6	Ministry of Economy (MoE)	X					CBRP developed and approved by SC, including an initial 95 posts.
7	Ministry of Urban Development (MUDA)	X	X	X			CBRP developed and approved by SC, including 90 posts (initial 70 posts).
8	Ministry of Rehabilitation and Rural Development (MRRD)	X		X	X	X	CBRP developed and approved by SC, including an initial 300 posts.
9	Ministry of Commerce and Industry (MoCI)	X	X				CBRP under development.
10	Ministry of Energy and Water (MEW)	X			X		CBRP under development.
11	Ministry of Public Works (MoPW)	X		X	X	X	CBRP under development.
12	Independent Directorate of Local Government (IDLG)	X					Newly included independent agency. CBRP under development.
13	Arazi	X	X			X	Newly included independent agency. CBRP under development.

Question 12: How can a Ministry/Independent Agency apply for CBR?

The CBR application process has four stages:

Stage 1: Determine Category of CBR support
All interested line ministries and independent agencies are categorized into two groups. Category I includes 13 line ministries and independent agencies as well as CBR implementing entities (MoF, IARCSC and AOP). All other interested ministries and agencies are included within Category II.
Stage 2: Development of CBR Reform Proposal
In either category, line ministries/agencies are required to develop a CBR reform proposal – a Capacity Building for Results Proposal (CBRP). However, whereas Category I requires development of a comprehensive CBRP for which CBR avails supportive resources (technical assistance), Category II ministries or agencies are only required to prepare a brief but focused CBRP.
Stage 3: Submission, review and approval of CBR Review Proposal
The ministry or agency is required to submit its completed CBRP to the MoF PSU. This office which acts as Secretariat to CBR's Steering Committee presents Category I proposals for screening by an Independent Expert Group (IEG) in Category I. The IEG presents its recommendations to the Steering Committee which makes the final decision on the proposal. Category II proposals do not require IEG screening and are forwarded to the Steering Committee following initial review by the MoF PSU.
Stage 4: Implementation of CBR Proposal
The ministry or agency commences implementation of its agreed CBRP, and MoF PSU and IARCSC PSU facilitate resources as outlined in the ministry/agency's approved proposal.

Question 13: What is a CBRP?

A Capacity Building for Results Proposal or "CBRP" means a document, setting forth elements specified in the Operations Manual, which inter alia: (i) describes a line Ministry/Agency's mandate, operational performance goals and sector reform strategies; (ii) demonstrates how said ministry/agency's organizational structure and staffing will be aligned to its core functions at the central, provincial and district levels; (iii) explains how donor financing will be aligned with strategic goals; (iv) describes the business processes and actions required to better meet the ministry/agency's mandate; and (v) provides a strategy to reduce reliance on international and national technical assistance, and a detailed implementation plan and results framework with annual targets

Question 14: How is CBR monitoring results?

Each line ministry/agency has a results framework in their CBRP tracking progress on selected reform areas related to both "capacity" (e.g. recruitment and training) and "performance" (e.g. development budget execution and business process) target improvements i.e. in line with CBR's overall development objective "to improve the capacity and performance of priority line ministries and independent agencies in selected reform areas". Specific target improvements vary for each line ministry and independent agency depending on its respective CBRP and CBRP

Results Framework. CBR is in process of recruiting an M&E firm to support line ministries/agencies in streamlining and better focusing their frameworks, and in better monitoring and evaluating results.

IV. How does the CBR recruitment process work?

Question 15: How does the recruitment process take place?

To help overcome bottlenecks associated with civil servants recruitment supported by CBR, a number of new measures have been adopted by the program. These primarily center around entrusting recruitment responsibility for all grades of approved (Tashkeel) positions directly to respective line ministries and independent agencies in line with Presidential legal Decree Number 82 on Recruitment issued on September 6, 2015. This will involve the transfer of responsibility for Grade 1 and 2 recruitment, previously under the oversight of IARCSC with IARCSC providing guidance and oversight of the process with the support of an independent HR firm. This is intended to accelerate the recruitment process as well as to promote ownership and capacity of line ministries and independent agencies. A new CBR recruitment procedure reflecting changes to the recruitment process was issued by IARCSC in January 2016 and now applies to all new recruitments.

Question 16: How long is the recruitment process and what are some simplification measures that may be taken to shorten it?

The length and speed of the recruitment process is set/determined by the respective line ministries/agencies which are now responsible for their own recruitments. Since being adopted by the project in January 2016, the new CBR recruitment procedure has already led to much faster processes e.g. 81 civil servants have been recruited out of 719 advertised positions. However, the results vary considerably from one line ministry/agency to another. On the project and wider political level, supportive measures are being taken to assist the process, including:

- Requesting cabinet to waive the requirement for ministers to sit on selection panels, allowing minister's to delegate this responsibility which causes significant delays/disruption;
- Exploring measures to simplify and streamline the recruitment procedure further including shortening the period for appeals; and
- Providing additional training and capacity building on the new recruitment procedure to line ministries/agencies, and availing technical assistance (project has contracted 10 pooled national specialists) to support line ministry/agency capacity to carry out recruitment e.g. job description preparation, examination-setting, selection etc.

Question 17: Who is eligible to apply for a CBR civil service position?

CBR funded positions are civil servants for which recruitment takes place according to existing civil servant laws and regulations. Therefore all Afghans who meet the minimum requirements of advertised positions are eligible to apply and be selected for CBR civil service posts.

Question 18: How does CBR ensure that women are represented in CBR recruitments?

CBR includes specific targets associated with the number of women recruited in civil servant positions through CBR. This is set at 30% (at least 450 posts) in line with the overall civil service

target. Achievement of this target is tracked and measured through specific indicator/s in the CBR's results framework. Based on current achievements, CBR will need to work closely with line ministries and independent agencies (now responsible for managing their own recruitment processes) to build-in more measures towards the achievement of this target. Better results have been achieved in terms of ensuring the participation of women in training. For example, the first batch of the Midlevel Management Development (MMD) Program set and met its minimum target of 40% (40). This was aided through preferential scoring criteria for female applicants selected to take the program's entry examination.

Question 19: How is corruption/nepotism in the CBR recruitment process addressed?

Several measures have been adopted in this respect and include:

- IARCSC has developed clear procedures to guide line ministries/agencies to carry out their recruitment responsibility;
- The new recruitment procedure builds-in mechanisms for real-time monitoring, reporting, and complaints' handling (appeals), the implementation of which by line ministries/agencies will be overseen and coordinated by IARCSC;
- An HR firm leads the process of quality checking and clearing recruitments carried out by line ministries/agencies, and will advise the IARCSC about the eligibility of the selections to be funded through CBR. For this purpose the Terms of Reference (TORs) of the HR-Firm have been amended accordingly;
- Signing of CBR civil servant contracts by IARCSC (under "witness" signature of respective line ministry/agency), with IARCSC signing only upon validation of adherence to minimum qualification requirements and standards of quality recruitment process, salary determination criteria (new NTA salary scale), and approved staffing targets;
- Contract and performance management of recruited civil servants to be conducted by IARCSC (Civil Service Management Department);
- Monthly reporting to the World Bank task team on contracts signed, appropriateness of the process (qualifications, salaries etc.), and on the number and status of recruitment grievances received;
- World Bank periodic post-review recruitment audits; and
- Number of recruitment rejections (due to non-compliance) are being published in monthly monitoring tables shared with Cabinet, and will have implications for reducing and/or removing line ministry/agency recruitment allocations).

V. How does CBR link with the new NTA Scale?

Question 20: How are CBR positions different from Pay and Grading positions?

CBR funded positions are Pay and Grading (P&G) positions which are permanent Tashkeel positions. The only difference is that CBR provides additional salary incentives to attract higher caliber candidates for Tashkeel positions funded by the program which target highly technical senior and mid-level management positions. It should however be noted that once the CBR program concludes, recruited appointees will remain in their positions as civil servants. For this purpose, CBR civil servant appointees' contracts are categorized into P&G (base-salary) and CBR allowance (top-up).

Question 21: How are remunerations for CBR civil servants determined?

Remuneration for CBR positions are determined based on meticulous analysis of current labor market rates. Salaries for these new positions are assigned higher than the P&G salary to motivate talented and qualified civil servants to apply for the highly technical and senior and mid-level management level positions targeted by CBR. A CBR appointees' previous salary does not factor into the determination of his/her CBR salary or individual offer.

Question 22: How does CBR link to the new NTA Salary Scale?

An important step recently taken is the harmonization of CBR funded salaries with those of donor funded contracted positions (NTA) such as local consultants and advisors supporting or embedded within government. This serves to avoid competition with CBR by removing the financial incentive for qualified Afghans to apply to a CBR civil servant position as opposed to previously higher paying NTA positions. This will help to increase CBR civil servant recruitments and thereby contribute to reducing dependence on NTA. This is criticial for fiscal sustainability and long term capacity of the core civil service. The new NTA scale also serves to provide:

- A harmonized, consistent, fair and transparent pay framework for all NTA
- Assurance of fiscal sustainability.
- Increased government control over NTA, including strengthening the ability of government to hire national contractors through the national budget
- Assurance of transparency and accountability.

Question 23: Who is covered by the new NTA scale? Contracted staff under many projects are not necessarily 'consultants', they can be contracted staff performing routine support functions in FM/ procurement/ administration/ HR. Are they still NTA for the purpose of applying the new NTA scale?

Both categories of consultant are covered by the scale - it applies equally to national consultants embedded in government such as Project Implementation Unit (PIU) staff which are thought of more as (contracted) staff, and to national consultants working in support of government such as consultants procured by projects to support line ministries/agencies or PIUs themselves; it applies also to CBR civil servants. One related point is that both category of consultant are targeted to be reduced, starting with the latter category. These are often hired

on long-term or renewable contracts and to perform core line functions. Now that CBR has begun to recruit civil servants, it is available to all line ministries/agencies (whether Category I or not) and salary scales have been harmonized, there is no reason for these positions not to be advertised as Tashkeel (through CBR). This should start immediately (in the short-term). The second category of national consultant (PIU contracted staff) is also targeted for reduction but this is more of a gradual (medium to long term) objective linked to line ministry/agency reform plans (CBRPs) and requiring commensurate capacity to first be filled within core line functions.

Question 24: Who is primarily responsible to ensure the NTA scales are enforced?

Primary responsibility lies with MoF (Budget Department). The Budget Department is in the process of setting up a Supervisory Committee for this purpose. This Committee will be chaired by the Budget Department and includes permanent membership of IARCSC. MoF has also proposed that the World Bank and one rotating donor representative be part of the Committee. MOF is currently compiling a database of all on and off budget NTA contracts across LM/As and, through the Committee (to meet quarterly), expects to receive quarterly update reports from line ministries/agencies (and funding donors) on type, number, duration, salary etc. of NTA. Non-compliance will have implications on line ministry/agency project allotments starting from June 30, 2016.

Question 25: How is MoF communicating the NTA to relevant stakeholders?

MOF is organizing a round of workshops with line ministries/agencies, the first of which has already been held with the budget departments of all line ministries/agencies, and additional workshops are to be held upon demand. The budget departments of each line ministry/agency have been appointed focal points for reporting and monitoring compliance on the new NTA scale (on behalf of their line ministry/agency). Given the high number of PIUs, MOF relies on line ministry/agency focal points (budget departments) to communicate the relevant information within their respective line ministry/agency, including to PIUs.

Question 26: Is there clarity among those responsible to implement as to which contracted staff fit in which step within each grade (especially with ongoing contracts)?

MoF has attempted to map out the qualifications and examples of job titles relevant to each grade in a detailed table within the new NTA guideline. At the request of donors, the clarification note (01) elaborates further on these. Some job profiles/titles will not fit neatly with the examples provided by MoF (especially as grading nomenclatures differ from donor to donor), in which case the TOR should guide (matching against the qualifications criteria outlined in the guidelines) – the TOR should always be the starting point for this exercise. The NTA Supervisory Committee will also be able (during quarterly review process) to adjust a consultant's grade if not correctly matched with the criteria described in the guideline.

VI. How to get in touch with CBR?

Question 27: Whom should I contact if I have any questions on CBR?
You can directly contact CBR at the following email address or telephone number:
Mobile: +93 (0) 786700008
Email: info@cbr.gov.af

Question 28: Where can I find CBR on social media?
You can find detailed information about CBR by visiting the CBR website and the program's official Facebook page and Twitter handle:
Website: www.cbr.gov.af
Facebook: https://www.facebook.com/cbrafghanistan
Twitter: https://twitter.com/CBRAfg

Question 29: Where can I find CBR vacancy announcements?
You can find all employment opportunities funded by the program by visiting the "job opportunities" section of the CBR website. CBR job vacancies are also announced through (www.jobs.af, www.acbr.org and www.wazifa.af) job search websites.

Question 30: How can I send a complaint?
Should you have a complaint related to CBR please complete the form in the "Submit a Complaint" section of the CBR website. The CBR complaints' procedure is designed to make ensure that all the complaints are addressed as quickly as possible and covers complaints ranging from: the procurement of services including complaints related to recruitment of consultants for line ministries/agencies, as well as program staff working for the MoF PSU. Complaints can also be sent directly to CBR using the below email:
Email: complaints@cbr.gov.af